#### Aeroecology meets aviation safety: Early warning systems prevent collisions between birds and aircraft

HANS VAN GASTEREN, KAREN L. KRIJGSVELD, NADINE KLAUKE, YOSSI LESHEM, ISABEL C. METZ, MICHAL SKAKUJ, SERGE SORBI, INBAL SCHEKLER AND JUDY SHAMOUN-BARANES

## Introduction

Bird migration and military flying

• Summary of a synthesis paper for Ecography

Overview of bird monitoring and warning systems (Germany, the Netherlands, Belgium, Poland and Israel)

The impact of bird strikes on military aviation

**Effectiveness of migration monitoring systems in bird strike avoidance** 

**Conclusion and future role of weather radars** 

## **Bird migration**





© Bruderer 2018

# Military flying

#### Minimum flight altitude for jet aircraft, e.g.

- Germany 1500ft
- The Netherlands 1200ft
- Belgium 1000ft

#### Low flying areas

• e.g. Germany

#### Low flying routes

• Germany, the Netherlands, Belgium 250ft



## Overlap in space and time



(a) Möggingen, autumn



Bruderer, 2018

# Bird monitoring and warning systems

Huge flocks of Lesser-spotted Eagles (Aquila pomarina) 28.9.86 - 1130 hrs. Ben Gurion Radar - length of line 82km



Military air-surveillance systems



## Bird monitoring and warning system (II)

weather radar network Averaged Nocturnal Avian Migration Traffic **Migration Traffic Rate** Directional Variability O 250 birds km<sup>-1</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> 0 500 birds km<sup>-1</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> 750 birds km<sup>-1</sup> hr<sup>-1</sup> 0 60°N 1000 birds km-1 hr-1 1250 birds km-1 hr-1 40°N 1000





1 3 4

> 5 6

www.flysafe-birdtam.eu

Nilsson, 2018

# En-route warning system

- Birds and pilots cannot avoid each other
- Prevention by avoiding high bird densities in the air in space and time
- Standard NATO-agreement defines risk
  - Regulations differ between countries
- •BIRDTAM warning system in use by Germany, Belgium, Denmark and the Netherlands



# Bird migration forecasts

#### (1) Manually

• Weather forecast model

#### (2) Regression model:

- migration intensities from air-surveillance radars
- meteorological data

#### (3) Ensemble model to improve predictions

• set of regression models

#### (4) Next steps

- Switching to weather radar network
- Recalibrate forecast models on individual weather radars
- Develop robust models using spatial models and weather radar measurements, <u>by</u> <u>combining international radar information</u>



# Impact of bird strikes on military aviation



#### **En-route bird strikes**

with fighter jets from Poland, Germany, Netherlands, Belgium and Israel

(A) Bird strike ratios

(B) Seasonal pattern and relative proportion of damage

(C) Effect of aircraft speed

(D) Height distribution of bird strikes

## Effectiveness of migration monitoring systems in bird strike avoidance (I)



## Effectiveness of migration monitoring systems in bird strike avoidance (II)

Assuming the same effectiveness, France & UK could have saved M\$4.5 – 5 US per year

	Country	Warning system	Bird Strike Ratio	Cost estimate /10³fl.hr	in M\$ US) / <u>yr</u>		
Data: Dekker & Van Gasteren, 2005 and this study	France Great Britain Germany Netherlands	absent absent present present	6.59 8.34 4.84 3.35	0.66 0.83 0.48 0.33	10.3 11.3 4.1 0.9	~45% reduction damaging bird strike ratio	

Financial costs related to bird strikes with damage in relation to presence or absence of warning system, to four NW-European air forces in 1991-2000. Based on a cost estimate of US\$100.000 per damage case (Insinna, 2018).

# Conclusion and future role weather radars

#### Warning systems have existed for decades, but:

- Only in a few countries
- Although agreement through NATO, harmonization in interpretation still lacking, because of different policies and different warning systems between countries
- Spatial and temporal differences exist between areas. Migration period is not the only period when the risk of low level bird strikes is high

### Bird strike ratios are much lower in countries where warning systems are implemented

The utilization of OPERA weather radar network is still in its infancy, but has huge potential for improving flight safety.

Lets start working together!!

## Thank you for your attention